



City of San Marino

Staff Report

*Rick Chou, Chair
Raymond Cheng, Vice Chair
Suzanne Torgeson, Member
Ted Lee, Member
Steven Jones, Member*

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

FROM: Isidro Figueroa, Community Development Director

BY: Aubrey Stark-Miller, Assistant Planner

DATE: June 18, 2025

SUBJECT: CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL FOR DESIGN REVIEW CASE NOS. DR 24-32, DR 24-40, AND DR 24-41 AT 1767 VIRGINIA ROAD FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW 664 SQUARE-FOOT GARAGE, INSTALLATION OF EAGLELITE CAPISTRANO CONCRETE TILE ROOFING MATERIAL, AND WINDOW AND FAÇADE CHANGES VISIBLE FROM THE STREET (LYND)

STRATEGIC PLAN CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS

Beautiful, Preserved, Single-Family Neighborhoods;
Engaged and Connected Residents

BACKGROUND

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing, attached two-car garage and portion of the existing attached breezeway to construct a new approximately 664 square-foot (SF) three-car garage attached to the existing single-family residence located at 1767 Virginia Road, in the R-1 Zone, Area District V. The project also proposes a re-roof to Eaglelite Capistrano concrete "S" tile roofing material in the Santa Cruz Blend color, and minor façade and window changes including the relocation of windows and the replacement of shutters. The project requires the following design review actions:

- **Design Review Case No. DR 24-32:** Pursuant to San Marino Municipal Code (SMMC) § 23.15.04 (C), the construction of any accessory structure visible from public view which exceeds six hundred (600) square-feet in total lot coverage requires design review.

- **Design Review Case No. DR 24-40:** Pursuant to SMMC § 23.15.04 (E), the installation of Eaglelite Capistrano concrete tile roofing material in the Santa Cruz Blend color requires design review since the proposed roofing product and color is not found on the City's Pre-Approved Roofing Materials, Colors, and Applications List.
- **Design Review Case No. DR 24-41:** Pursuant to SMMC § 23.15.04 (A)(1), an alteration to an existing residential structure which changes the appearance of the structure as viewed from a public street requires design review. This action is inclusive of window and front façade changes.

ZONING INFORMATION

General Plan Land Use Designation: Very Low Density Residential

Zoning: R-1, Area District V

Parcel Number (APN): 5335-001-013

Lot Size: 24,500 SF

Location: The property is located at the northwesterly intersection of Virginia Road and Roanoke Road, across the street from the San Marino Community Church.

Existing Use: Two-story single-family residence with an attached garage.

Surrounding Uses: One and two-story single-family residences, schools, and a religious institution.

TREE PRESERVATION

The project does not propose the removal or relocation of any trees.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

The subject property is identified on the Citywide Historic Resources Survey Report as a potential historic resource. The City's consultants, Architectural Resources Group, identified the subject residence as a potential district contributor to a future potential Oak Knoll Marino Residential Historic District. The survey found that the property appears to be eligible for listing on the National Register, California Register, and as a local listing. Further information is included on DPR Form 523, which is provided as Attachment 4.

NEIGHBORHOOD NOTIFICATION

Do Not Object – 0

Object – 0

No Response (with two attempts of certified mailings) – 10

ENVIRONMENTAL FINDING

The project proposes to demolish an existing, attached two-car garage and portion of the existing attached breezeway to construct a new approximately 664 square-foot, three-car garage attached to an existing single-family residence. The project also proposes a whole-house re-roof, and minor façade and window changes including the relocation of windows and the replacement of shutters. Pursuant to Section 21084 of the California Public Resource Code, the proposed project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to State CEQA Guidelines, Article 19, Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities), and there is no substantial evidence demonstrating that an exception to a categorical exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines, Section 15300.2 applies.

DISCUSSION

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing, attached two-car garage to construct a new approximately 664 SF three-car garage attached to the existing single-family residence located at 1767 Virginia Road. The garage maintains architectural compatibility with the existing two-story residence by providing consistent use of colors and materials, and maintaining the same layout as the existing garage, which is connected to the residence by a breezeway.

The project also proposes a complete re-roof to Eaglelite Capistrano concrete tile roofing material in the Santa Cruz Blend color, which is a reddish brown color. The proposed Eaglelite product simulates the look of mission clay tile roofing material which is compatible with the Monterey Revival architectural style of the subject residence. The applicant cited cost as one of the factors for selecting this roofing material.

Finally, the façade changes include a change in the window placement, shutters, and roofing material.

DESIGN REVIEW FINDINGS

Pursuant to SMMC § 23.15.09, the Design Review Committee (DRC) shall

consider the durability, quality and cost of construction materials when raised as an issue by the applicant; and approve the application if it finds all of the following to be true:

1. That the proposed structure is compatible with the Neighborhood.

Residences within the Legal Neighborhood are primarily designed in various Period Revival architectural styles, including, but not limited to, American Colonial, Spanish Colonial, and Tudor Revival. The subject residence is constructed in the Monterey Revival architectural style, which is not proposed to change. The proposed three-car garage, which is visible from Roanoke Road, maintains the same layout as the existing garage and is designed to be compatible with the existing residence. The proposed façade and window changes minimally alter the appearance of the structure and are found to be compatible with the Neighborhood.

Therefore, this project meets this finding.

2. That the proposed structure is designed and will be developed in a manner which balances the reasonable expectation of privacy of persons residing on contiguous properties with the reasonable expectations of the applicants to develop their property within the restrictions of this code.

The proposed window replacement will minimally alter the North and South (side) elevations. Only Windows W205, W206, and W207 on the North elevation provide a potential line of sight onto the neighboring residence located at 1749 Virginia Road. Staff finds that the project does not increase the number of windows alongside the North elevation, and therefore, the potential line of sight is not significantly greater than the existing. Furthermore, the existing trees and hedges alongside the North property line prevent the visual observation between the subject property and the neighboring property located at 1749 Virginia Road. This finding does not apply to the proposed three-car garage and roofing material.

As such, this project meets this finding.

3. In the case of a building addition, the proposal is compatible with the existing building which includes the rooflines.

The project will provide a new, attached three-car garage in the footprint of the existing attached two-car garage. The new garage is designed to match the existing residence in design, colors, and materials. The breezeway connecting the proposed garage to the existing two-story residence provides

a break in massing. The garage also remains subordinate to the two-story residence

Therefore, this project meets this finding.

4. That the colors and materials are consistent and match the existing building or structure.

The project will provide a new, attached three-car garage that is consistent with the stucco on the exterior façade of the existing residence, and will provide consistent windows, doors, and roofing material.

As such, this project meets this finding.

DESIGN REVIEW FINDINGS (ROOFING MATERIAL)

SMMC § 23.15.04 (E) states that, in reviewing roof materials and applications, in addition to the design review standards, the DRC shall consider all of the following when raised by the applicant:

1. Fire, wind and/or earthquake safety;

The proposed Eaglelite Capistrano concrete "S" tile roofing material in the Santa Cruz Blend color is Class A fire rated and can withstand sustained winds up to 180 miles per hour. Regulatory compliance measures from the California Building Code and the City's Building Code regulate roofing materials and its installation to be fire, wind, and/or earthquake standards compliant. As such, the proposed material complies with SMMC § 23.15.04 (E)(1).

2. Structural integrity;

The product weight is approximately 3.05 pounds per square foot, which is under the 6 pounds per square-foot threshold requiring structural engineering of the roof. Regulatory compliance measures from the California Building Code and the City's Building Code regulate roofing materials and its' installation to be compliant with structural standards. As such, the proposed material complies with SMMC § 23.15.04 (E)(2).

3. The extent the roof is exposed to public view or view by neighbors; and

The roof pitch of the existing home and garage will be visible from public view and by neighbors; however, the proposed concrete "S" tile roofing material is compatible with the design of the home. The project does not propose any

additions or changes to the roof that will alter its footprint or visibility. As such, the project material complies with SMMC § 23.15.04 (E)(3).

4. The ability of the proposed roofing material to successfully dispose of rainwater for the particular house.

The product specification sheet, provided as Attachment 5, states that Eaglelite Capistrano concrete "S" tile roofing material feature water-resistant asphalt, and offer more durability and better performance than natural wood shakes. The installation of gutters to screen eave edges are also a condition of approval for composition shingles and will assist with disposing of rainwater.

In addition, the California Building Code requires that flashing be installed in such a manner so as to prevent moisture from entering the wall and roof. Regulatory compliance measures from the California Building Code and the City's Building Code regulate roofing materials and installation in the City to be compliant with drainage standards. As such, the proposed material complies with SMMC § 23.15.04 (E)(4).

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information submitted to the record, staff recommends the Design Review Committee:

1. Determine that the project is exempt from CEQA pursuant to State CEQA Guidelines, Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities), and that there is no substantial evidence demonstrating an exception to the categorical exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines § 15300.2 applies;
2. Find that the project meets all applicable findings; and
3. Approve the project as proposed.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Project Plans
2. Neighborhood Map
3. Neighborhood Notification Documents
4. DPR Form 523 (District and Primary Record)
5. Eaglelite Capistrano "S" Tile Brochure and Specifications Sheet
6. Window and Door Photos
7. Arborist Report